

Critique of a Critique – A Response to the Article “An Evaluation of the Theory of the Desirability of Martyrdom in the Hussaini Movement”

*Mir Saeid Moosavi Karimi**

DOI: 10.22096/rc.2025.2041118.1215

Received Date: 13/04/2025 - Accepted Date: 20/09/2025

Abstract

My perspective, as presented in a trilogy of articles under the titles “War and Martyrdom as the Main Method: a new Analysis of the Reason for the Uprising of Imam Hossein (peace be upon him)”, “A Theory of War and Seeking Martyrdom as the Major Means of Imam al-Husain’s Uprising: An Appraisal of Confirming Historical Evidence”, and “A Theory of War and Seeking-Martyrdom as the Major Means of Imam al-Husayn’s (AS) Uprising: An Appraisal of Contradictory Historical Evidence”, has been critiqued by Abdorrahim Soleimani, in an article published in the Journal of *Religion & The Contemporary World*, titled “Evaluation of the theory of the desirability of martyrdom in the Hosseini movement”. In this article, I aim to demonstrate that his criticisms are either incorrect, already addressed in the aforementioned trilogy, or are claims lacking any rational or transmitted (theological, narrative, or historical) evidence.

Key Words: Imam al-Husain; Seeking-Martyrdom; Uprising; Historical Evidence.

* Professor, Department of Philosophy, Mofid University, Qom, Iran.
Email: msmkarimi@mofidu.ac.ir



Bibliography

The Holy Quran.

Esfandiari, Mohammad. *Ashura Shenasi*. Tehran: Ney, 2019. [In Persian]

Soleimani, Abdolrahim. "Evaluation of the Theory of the Desirability of Martyrdom in the Hosseini Movement." *Journal of Religion and the Contemporary World* 10, no. 1 (Spring and Summer 2023): 7-18. [In Persian]

Shariati, Ali. Hossein, *Husayn, the Heir of Adam*. Tehran: Qalam, 1982. [In Persian]

Qundoozi, Suleiman ibn Ibrahim. *Yanabi' al-Mawaddah li-Dhawi al-Qurba*. Volume 3, edited by: Ali ibn Jamal Ashraf Hosseini. Qom: Monazzama al-Awqaf wa al-Shu'oun al-Khayriya, Dar al-Oswa lil-Tiba'a wa al-Nashr, 2001. [In Arabic]

Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeed. "A Theory of War and Seeking Martyrdom as Major Means: An Analysis of Imam al-Huseyn's (AS) Uprising from Theological and Hadith Point of View." *Journal of Religion and the Contemporary World* 9, no. 2 (Fall and Winter 2022): 7-36. [In Persian]

Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeed. "Life As a Divine Right, Not a Human Right." *Criminal Law Research* 14, no. 2 (Fall and Winter 2023): 151-169. [In Persian]

Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeed. "Right to Life, a Divine Right or a Human Right?" *The Journal of Human Rights* 18, no. 1 (Spring and Summer 2023): 7-35. [In Persian]

Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeed. "A Theory of War and Seeking Martyrdom as the Major Means of Imam al-Husain's Uprising: An Appraisal of Confirming Historical Evidence." *Journal of Historical Researches* 15, no. 2 (Summer 2023): 1-21. [In Persian]

Mousavi Karimi, Mirsaeed. "A Theory of War and Seeking-Martyrdom as the Major Means of Imam al-Husayn's (AS) Uprising: An Appraisal of Contradictory Historical Evidence." *Religion and the Contemporary World* 11, no. 1 (Spring and Summer 2024). [In Persian]

Homayi, Jalal al-Din. *Asrar va Asar-e Vaqe'e Karbala*. Tehran: Dehkhoda, 1978. [In Persian]