

A Theory of War and Seeking Martyrdom as Major Means: An Analysis of Imam al-Huseyn's (AS) Uprising from Theological and Hadith Point of View

*Mirsaeid Musavi Karimi**

DOI: 10.22096/RC.2023.1985834.1091

[Received Date: 26/12/2022 - Accepted Date: 31/05/2023]

Abstract

in this paper, by using the method of IBE, a theory as follows is proposed which can explain rationally and justifiably the method that Imam al-Huseyn (AS) chose for his movement: Imam Huseyn (AS) from the beginning of his movement chose to participate in war and seek martyrdom consciously and voluntarily as the major mean to reach his aim and used other means such as trying for government formation, negotiation with his enemies, and peacekeeping as the minor means to facilitate the major one. The paper is organized as follows: in the first part, after explaining IBE briefly, and making a necessary distinction between two notions of method and purpose, the most common and important rival theories explaining Imam al-Huseyn's (AS) uprising will be introduced. Then, by introducing some theological and Hadith evidence, it will be shown that the suggested theory, compared to its rivals, is the best explanatory one. Moreover, the theory can produce a theological and rational explanation for a disagreement between two infallible Imams. Hence, belief in the truth of the suggested theory is rational and justified. In the final section, from a theological point of view, we will discuss four related subjects: why Imam al-Huseyn's (AS) chosen method was the most effective and efficient; the legality of Imam's method; the morality of Imam's method; and whether people are religiously permitted to follow Imams' method.

Key Words:

IBE; Imam al-Huseyn (AS); Uprising; Seeking Martyrdom; Hadith.

* Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, Mofid University, Qom, Iran.
Email: msmkarimi@mofidu.ac.ir



Bibliography

Quran.

Nahj al-Balagha.

Abu Mikhnaf, Lut ibn Yahya. *Maqatal al-Husayn*, M.H. Yusufi Gharavi (ed.). Qom: Society of Seminary Teachers of Qom, 1996. [In Persian]

adh-Dhahabī, Shams ad-Dīn. *Tarikh al-Islam al-kabir*. vols 5, 8. O. A. al-Tadmari (ed.). Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Arabi, 1992. [In Persian]

al-Bahrani, Seyed Hashem. *Al-Burhan fi Tafsir al-Quran*. vol. 5. Qom: al-Be'tha Institute, 1994. [In Persian]

al-Balādhurī, Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā. *Ansab al-Ashraf*. Vol. 3. S. Zakar & R. al-Zerkeli. Beirut: Dar al-Fekr, 1996. [In Persian]

Alexander, Larry, and Michael Moore. "Deontological Ethics", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Summer 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/ethics-deontological/>

al-Hillī, Ali bin al-Muṭahhar. *Al-Bāb al-ḥādī 'ashar*. Tehran: Islamic Studies, 1986. [In Persian]

al-Hillī, Ali bin al-Muṭahhar. *Kashf al-murād fi sharḥ tajrīd al-i'tiqād*. Beirut: al-Alami le-almatbu'at, 1978. [In Persian]

al-Himyari, Abd Allah b. ja'far. *Qurb al-isnad*. Qom: Ahl-albeyt le-ehya al-Toras, 1992. [In Persian]

al-Irbili, Ali bin Isa. *Kashf al-Ghumma fi Ma'rifat al-A'imma*. vol. 1. Qom: al-Sharif al-Razi, 2000. [In Persian]

al-Khwarizmi, Moafagh ibn Ahmad. *Maghtal al-Husayn*. vol. 1. M. Samavi (ed.). Qom: Anvar al-Hoda, 2002. [In Persian]

al-Murtaḍā, Alī b. al-Ḥusayn. *Al-Dhakhīra fi Elm al-Kalam*, S.A. Huseini. Qom: Nashr Islami, 1990. [In Persian]

al-Sayyid al-Murtaḍā, Alī b. al-Ḥusayn. *Tanzīh al-anbīyā'*. Beirut: Dar al-Azva, 1988. [In Persian]

Al-Shaykh al-Tusi, Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan. *Talkhis al-shafi*. vol. 4. H. Bahr al-Olum. Qom: Mohebbin, 2003. [In Persian]

al-Ṭabarī, Muḥammad ibn Jarīr. *Tarīkh al-Rusul wa-l-Mulūk (History of the Prophets and Kings)*. vol. 5. Cairo: Dar al-Ma'aref, 1967,

avail at: https://archive.org/details/Tarikh_Tabari/trm05/mode/2up
[In Persian]

- Dinawari, Abu Hanifa. *Kitāb al-Akhhār al-Tiwāl*. M. Abdolmonem Am (ed.). Qom: Manshoorat al-Sharif al-Razi, 1994. [In Persian]
- Douven, Igor. “Abduction”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (2017): edited by Edward N. Zalta. available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2017/entries/abduction/>.
- Douven, Igor. “Testing Inference to the Best Explanation”, *Synthese* 130 (2002): 355–377.
- Esfandiari, Mohammad. *Ashura-Shenasi*. Tehran: Nashre-Ney, 2019. [In Persian]
- Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari, M. M. *An Analysis of Epistemological Justification of Inference to the Best Explanation*. Ph.D. Thesis, M. Mousavi Karimi, and E. Azadegan (supervisors). Tehran: Sharif University of Technology, 2016. [In Persian]
- Fanaei, Abolghasem. *Afsson Gole Sorkh (Fascination of a Red Flower)*. Tehran: Nagah Mo’aser, 2021. [In Persian]
- Frances, Bryan, and Jonathan Matheson “Disagreement”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, (2019): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2019/entries/disagreement/>
- Harman, Gilbert. “The Inference to the Best Explanation”, *Philosophical Review* 74 (1965): 88–95.
- Hart, Michael. *The 100: A Ranking of the Most Influential Persons in History*. New York: Carol Publishing Group, (1993[1978]).
- Hasan, Ali, and Richard Fumerton. “Knowledge by Acquaintance vs. Description”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, (2020): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2020/entries/knowledge-acquaindescrip>.
- Hepburn, Brian, and Hanne Andersen “Scientific Method”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, (2021): edited by Edward N. Zalta. Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/scientific-method/>
- Hursthouse, Rosalind, and Glen Pettigrove. “Virtue Ethics”, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (winter 2018 Edition): edited

- by Edward N. Zalta, available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2018/entries/ethics-virtue/>.
- Ibn A'tham al-Kufi, Ahmad. *Kitāb al-Futūḥ (Book of Conquests)*. Ali Shiri (ed.). Beirut: Dar al-Azva, 1990. [In Persian]
- Ibn Asakir, Alī ibn al-Ḥasan. *Tarikh Dimashq*. vols 13, 14. Beirut: Dar al-Fekr, 1983. [In Persian]
- Ibn Asakir, Alī ibn al-Ḥasan. *Terjomah Reyhanah Rasool-allah (SA) Al-Imam Al-Husayn (AS) men Tarikh Dimashq*. Qom: Majma al-Ehya al-Theghafiyeh al-Islamiyeh, 1993. [In Persian]
- Ibn Athir. *al-Kamil fil-Ta'rikh*. vol 3. Beirut: Dar Sader, 1978. [In Persian]
- Ibn Hajar, Shihāb al-Dīn. *Al-Sawa'iq al-Muhriqah*. Mansurah: Maktab Fayyaz, 2008. [In Persian]
- Ibn Kathir. *Al-Bidayah wa'an-Nihayah*. vol. 8. Ali Shiri (ed.). Beirut: Dar Ehya al-Torath al-Arabi, 1988. [In Persian]
- Ibn Qulawayh, Ja'far b. Muḥammad. *Kāmil al-zīyārāt*. vol.1. A. Amini (ed.). Najaf Ashraf: Dar al-mortazaviyah, 1977. [In Persian]
- Ibn Sa'd, Muḥammad ibn Sa'd. *Tarjomah Al-Imam Husein va Maghtalahoo (As) Men Kitāb al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kabīr*. Tabatabaei (ed.). Qom: Ahl-albeyt le-ehya al-Toras, 1995. [In Persian]
- Ibn Shahrashub. *Manaqib Ale Abi Talib*. vols 2, 4. M.A. Ashtiyani, and H. Rasuli (Eds.). Qom: Allameh, 1959. [In Persian]
- Ibn Sina. *Kitāb al-Shifā (The Book of Healing): Al-Ilahiyat (Theology)*. Qom: Mar'ashi Najafi Library, 1983. [In Persian]
- Ishtihārdī, Alī Panāh. *Infamous Seven Years*. Qom: Elmiyeh, 1971. [In Persian]
- Josephson, John R, and Susan G Josephson. (Eds.) *Abductive Inference: Computation, Philosophy, Technology*. Cambridge: CUP, 2003.
- Khomeini, Ruhollah. *Velayat-e Faqih: Hokumat-i Eslami*. Tehran: The Institute for Compilation and Publication of Imam Khomeini's Works, 1999. [In Persian]
- Kuipers, T.A.F. "Naive and Refined Truth Approximation", *Synthese* 93 (1992): 299–341.
- Ladyman, James. "Would't It Be Lovely: Explanation and Scientific Realism", *Metascience* 14 (2005): 331–361.

- Lipton, Peter. *Inference to the Best Explanation* (2nd ed.). London: Routledge, 2004.
- Lycan, William.G. *Judgement and Justification*. Cambridge: CUP, 1988.
- Mahmudi, Mohammad Bagher. *Nahj al-Sa'adah fi Mostadrak Nahj al-Balagha*. vol. 3. Najaf Ashraf: al-No'man, 1968. [In Persian]
- Majlesi, Mohammad-Baqer. *Bihar al-Anwar*. vols 29, 44. Beirut: al-Vafa, 1982. [In Persian]
- Mofid, Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad. *Al-Irshad fi ma'rifat hujaj Allah 'ala l-'ibad*. vols 1, 2. Qom: Ahl-albeyt le-ehya al-Toras, 1995. [In Persian]
- Motahhari, Morteza. *Emamat va Rahbari*. Qom: Sadra, 2013. [In Persian]
- Motahhari, Morteza. *Hamase -e- Husaini (Husaynian Epic)*. vol. 2. Qom: Sadra, 1997. [In Persian]
- Motahhari, Morteza. *Hamase -e- Husaini (Husaynian Epic)*. vol. 3. Qom: Sadra, 1986. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M. "A Theory of War and Seeking Martyrdom as the Major Means of Imam al-Husayn's Uprising: An Appraisal of Confirming Historical Evidence," *Historical Research*, University of Isfahan, 2023 (to be published). [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M. *An Introduction to the Philosophy of Language and Religious Language*. Qom: Mofid University Press, 2021. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. E'temad Al-Islami Bakhtiari. "Deficiency of Probabilistic Approach for Settling Voltaire's Objection," *Methodology of Social Science and Humanities (MSSH)* 25, Issue 98, (Spring 2019): 139-150. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari. "An Analysis of Probabilistic Criteria in Inference to the Best Explanation," *Logical Studies*, Article 2, Vol. 8, Issue 2 - Serial Number 16 (Summer and Autumn 2017): 25-48. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari. "Inference to the Best Explanation and "the Bad Lot Objection"," *Hasti va Shenakht (Journal of Existence and Knowledge)* 2, Issue 2 - Serial Number 4 (Autumn & Winter 2015): 111-130. [In Persian]

- Mousavi Karimi, M., and S. M. M. Etemadoleslami Bakhtiari. "The Relation between Explanatory Virtues and the Limitation of Hungerford's Objection," *Zehn (Mind)*, Serial Number 16, Issue 63, (Autumn 2015): 131-164. [In Persian]
- Psillos, Stathis. "Simply the Best: A Case for Abduction", Edited by A.C. Kakas & F. Sadri, *Computational Logic: Logic Programming and Beyond*, Berlin-Heidelberg: Springer, *Lecture Notes in Computer Science* 2408 (2002): 605–625.
- Safi Golpaygani, Lotfollah. *Hussein (AS): Aware Martyr*. Mashhad: Nashr va Tabligh, 1987. [In Persian]
- Salehi Najafabadi, Nematollah. *An Insight into Husaynian Epic*. Tehran: Kavir, 1969. [In Persian]
- Salehi Najafabadi, Nematollah. *Shahid-e Javid (The Eternal Martyr)*, 10th ed. Tehran: Omid Farda, 1997. [In Persian]
- Sayyed Ibn Tawus. *al-Lohoof*. Tehran: Osweh, 2001. [In Persian]
- Schupbach, J.N. "Is the Bad Lot Objection Just Misguided?", *Erkenntnis* 79 (2014): 55-64.
- Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter. "Consequentialism", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2021 Edition): edited by Edward N. Zalta. forthcoming. Available at:
<https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2021/entries/consequentialism/>
- Ṭabarī, Muḥibb al-Dīn. *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍirah fī Manāqib al-Asharah*. vol. 3. Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Elmiyah, 2003. [In Persian]
- Ṭabarī, Muḥibb al-Dīn. *Dhakha'ir al-Uqabi fī Manaqib dhawi al-Qurba*. vol. 1. Qom: Dar al-Kotob Islami, 2007. [In Persian]
- Tabarsi, Ahmad ibn Ali. *Al-Ihtijaj*. vol. 1. M.B. Khersan (ed.). Mashhad: Nashr Morteza, 1982. [In Persian]
- Van Fraassen, B.C. *Laws and Symmetry*. New York: OUP, 1989.
- Walker, David. "A Kuhnian Defense of Inference to the Best Explanation", *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science* 43 (2012): 64-73.