

The Qur'anic Doublets and the Hypothesis of the Later Redaction of the Canonical Qur'an A presentation and criticism of Gabriel Reynolds' hypothesis

Zahra Akhavan Sarraf *

DOI: 10.22096/rc.2021.243662

[Received Date: 21/12/2020 Acceptance Date: 28/05/2021]

Abstract

Unbelieving Qur'anic scholars have long studied Qur'an's codification and canonization. In his recent hypothesis, Gabriel Said Reynolds, assistant professor of Islamic studies and theology at the Notre Dame University of America, generalizes New Testament's modern research studies to Qur'an and focuses on Qur'an's "doublets" or repeating passages, and considers the present codex (mushaf) of the Qur'an as a result of the later redaction of a written text provided from two previous Meccan and Medinan written material. This article - which is the outcome of analyzing a detailed article, two speeches of the writer and a series of scientific correspondences and discussions with him - explains his hypothesis and research method, clarifies his methodological mistakes and violation of his own scientific criteria and thus falsifies the validity of his idea. It then academically questions the presuppositions, bases and the content of this view, mentioning the following points: the incompatibility of the Holy Qur'an and the New Testament and thus the invalidity of generalizing the research methods of the New Testament to the Holy Qur'an, the intentionality of repetition in the expressive style of the Qur'an and considering repetition as one of the feature of the Qur'an, Qur'an

* Lecturer at the seminary and university, Qom, Iran.
Email: akhavan_qom@yahoo.com



being oral and readable and transmitted from one heart to another heart through permitted recitations, disclosing the scientific flaws of this proposal resulted from neglecting the views of Muslim Qur'anic scholars, and explaining the inaccuracy of his evidences due to interpretational misunderstandings; it then shows the critical necessity of inspecting the idea.

Keywords: Qur'an's Doublets; Canonization of the Qur'an; Meccan Source; Medinan Source; Gabriel Reynolds; Orientalists; Redaction of the Qur'an.

Bibliography

A) Book and Articles

The Holy Quran

- Akhavan Sarraf, Zahra (2009). "Pathology of Quranic Studies of Orientalists", *Mishkat Quarterly*, No. 81, pp. 4-16. [In Persian]
- Al-Tasan, Muhammad ibn Abd al-Rahman (2013). *Al-Masahif Al-Mansuba lil-Sahaba wa al-Rrad Ala al-Shobahat al-Mathara Howlaha*, Riyadh: Dar al-Tadmuriyyah. [In Arabic]
- Amini, Nowruz (2020). "Critique of Wensbrough's view on the compilation of the Qur'an in the third century", *The Qur'an from Orientalists Point of View*, No. 29, pp. 154-120. [In Persian]
- Amir-Moezzi, Mohammad Ali; Dye, Guillaume(2019). *Le Coran des historiens*. Paris: Les éditions du Cerf.
- Anne-Sylvie Boisliveau(2020). "The Qur'an as a "Text and Commentary": A New Paradigm for Qur'anic Studies, *2020 Annual Meeting Program Book 2020 Annual Report*, p. 7.
- Balaghi, Mohammad Javad (n.d.). *Alaa al-Rahman fi Tafsir al-Quran*, researched by Al-Bi'that Institute, Islamic Research Unit, 1, First Edition, Qom: Vijdani. [In Arabic]
- Dye, Guillaume. "Le Coran et le problème synoptique." *"Composer, Écrire et transmettre le Coran au Premier siècle de l'islam"*. Université de Lorraine. 6 February 2020.
- Feiz Kashani, Mullah Mohsen (1997). *Al-Asfa Fi Tafsir Al-Quran*, First Edition, Qom: Markaz Intisharat Daftar Tabliqat Islami. [In Arabic]
- Graham, William (2013). "Considerations on the Book of Quranic Studies", translated and compiled by Morteza Kariminia, *Collection of Articles of Western Quranic Studies, Quranic Language, Quranic Interpretation*, Tehran: Hermes, pp. 220-221. [In Persian]
- Helli, Hassan Ibn Yusuf (2004). *Nahayat al-Vusul ila Ilm al-Usul*, First Edition, Qom: Mo'assisah Al-Imam Al-Sadiq (AS). [In Arabic]
- Irving, Thomas Ballantyne(2001). *The Qur'an: Translation and Commentary*. 2nd Edition. International Publishing Co.
- Kermani, Mahmoud Ibn Hamza (1997). *Al-Burhan Fi Mutishabeh Al-Quran*, researched by Ahmad Khalafullah, Al-Mansoura-Egypt: Dar Al-Wafa. [In Arabic]
- Ma'refat, Mohammad Hadi (2002). *Shobahat wa Rodud Howl Al-Qur'an Al-Karim*, Qom: Mo'assese Farhanqi Intisharati Tamhid. [In Arabic]

- Motzky, Harald (2013). "The Compilation of the Qur'an: A Review of Western Perspectives in the Light of New Methodological Developments", translated and compiled by Morteza Kariminia, *Collection of Articles of Western Quranic Studies, Quranic Language, Quranic Interpretation*, Tehran: Hermes, pp. 252- 293. [In Persian]
- Qosheiri, Abdul Karim Ibn Hawazen (2000). *Lata'if al-Isharat:Tafsir Sufi Kamil lil-Qur'an al-Karim*, researched by Ibrahim Bisyuni, Cairo: Al-Hiy'ah al-Misriyyah al-Ammah lil-Kitab. [In Arabic]
- Rabi Nataj, Ali Akbar (2012). "A Study of Orientalists' Perspectives on the Sources of the Qur'an", *The Qur'an from Orientalists Point of View*, No. 12, pp. 11-30. [In Persian]
- Reynolds, Gabriel Said(2020)."The Qur'ānic Doublets: A Preliminary Inquiry." *Journal of the International Qur'anic Studies Association*, Vol. 5, pp. 5-39.
- Reynolds, Gabriel Said. *What might doublets in the Qur'an tell us about the origins of the Text?* The Institute for Advanced Studies in Levant Culture and Civilization Centre of Excellence of the World Academy of Art & Science. 24 February 2021.
- Sadeghi, Behnam, Mohsen Goudarzi(2012). "Şan'ā' 1 and the origins of the Qur'ān," *Der Islam: Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Kultur des islamischen Orients*, Vol. 87i-ii pp. 1-129.
- Soyuti, Abd Al-Rahman Ibn Abi Bakr (2000). *Al-Itqan Fi Ulum Al-Qur'an*, research by Fawaz Ahmad Zamrali, Beirut: Dar Al-Kitab Al-Arabi. [In Arabic]
- Tabarsi, Fazl Ibn Hassan (1994). *Majma' Al-Bayan fi Tafsir al-Qur'an*, Tehran: Naser Khosrow. [In Arabic]

B) Websites

- Al-Ta'liq Ala Tafsir Al-Jalalain (20/6/1400). Sheikh Abdul Karim Al-Khudheir, <http://lib.efatwa.ir/46954/5/15> accessed on 20/6/1400.
- 66th meeting of the Quranic Discussions Association (30/4/1300); Archives of the Quranic Discussions Association. https://t.me/Anjoman_Mobahesat_Archive/646 accessed on 23/6/1400.